

## CONSULTATION QUESTIONS

The “Selected Admission: Making Migration Work for Britain” document launches a process of consultation. We shall be engaging with as wide a range of stakeholders as possible over the next four months and welcome comments on the proposals, and wider contributions to developing an effective managed migration system. During the consultation period we shall also be developing the evidence base, analysing the economic impact of options, and working in more detail on proposals for streamlined processes for the system. Further announcements will be made about improvements and proposals for the family reunion arrangements, and about the requirements to qualify for permanent residence. Further announcements about what is to be implemented will be made early in 2006.

For all questions, please feel free to provide comments on additional sheets of paper if there is not space here.

The questionnaire is provided in word format which can be downloaded for electronic completion or printed for hand written responses.

Completed questionnaires can be submitted electronically to:

[Pointsbased.consultation@ind.homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:Pointsbased.consultation@ind.homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk)

Or by post to:

Managed Migration Customer Services Team  
PO BOX 3468  
Sheffield  
S3 8WA  
Fax: 0114 259 3776

### Questions for consultation

#### General

- 1 Do you agree that the benefits of migration outweigh its costs?  
Yes  No
- 2 Can a managed migration system be used to deliver the UK the workers it needs?  
Yes  No
- 3 Is the current system too complex and bureaucratic?  
Yes  No
- 4 Should the users of the system or the taxpayer or both bear the costs of the migration system?  
Yes  Taxpayer  Both

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Question 1: The Optimum Population Trust is an organisation concerned with the environmental impacts of population growth, on the economic consequences of such environmental impacts, and the consequences of population growth on quality of life in the UK, in a global context. We answer NO, therefore, because in our view no benefits to the environment or to the environmental quality of life in the UK will arise from further population growth. Because excess inward migration is currently the main factor in UK population growth, we cannot agree that the benefits of excess inward migration outweigh its costs.

Question 2: We submit that managed migration can deliver needed workers, but that limits must be set to numbers to ensure a gradual decrease in population.

Question 4: We submit that because the taxpayer has to pay for the environmental consequences of population growth, the users of the system should bear the costs.

5 Do you think we should introduce these changes in a phased manner?

Yes  No

If so, which bits do you think should be implemented first?

Question 5: We submit that because the level of net inward migration is causing UK population to grow at an environmentally unsustainable rate, changes to reduce immigration levels should be introduced as quickly as possible.

6 Could the proposals to develop a new points-based system affect some groups of migrants more than others?

Yes  No

If yes, which groups and why?

Question 6: Since environmental impacts arise from the number of people migrating to and settling in the UK and their effect on population growth, rather than from the type of people who migrate to and settle in the UK, this question is not relevant to an environmental organisation.

### Objectives and tests

7 Do you agree that the objectives of the managed migration system should be focused primarily on economic benefit to the UK?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Question 7: We submit that the economic benefit of excess immigration is negligible or negative. We submit that although economic benefit is an important objective, to have any meaning a managed migration system must incorporate limits to population growth. Economic benefits cannot be considered in isolation from environmental disbenefits. We submit that degradation of the environment by population growth of more than 300,000 a year is already causing significant harm

- for example, by causing loss of landscape, biodiversity and other natural resources as a result of urbanisation and development to accommodate population growth; by causing rising congestion costs; and by undermining attempts to meet emissions and other environmental targets.

8 If managed migration were intended to meet non-economic objectives what would they be, and how would you measure them?

Question 8: See answers above. Assessment of the environmental objectives of a managed migration policy aimed at gradual population decrease could be measured by new economic indicators such as an overall UK population density indicator which could be added, as proposed by OPT, to the government's headline environmental indicators. These indicators could be measured against other environment and quality of life indicators to demonstrate the environmental effects of population growth versus decrease.

9 How would you rank the proposed tests for the system in order of priority? Please number them below from 1 to 8.

Test	Ranking
OPERABILITY	<input type="checkbox"/>
ROBUSTNESS	<input type="checkbox"/>
OBJECTIVITY	<input type="checkbox"/>
FLEXIBILITY	<input type="checkbox"/>
COST EFFECTIVENESS	<input type="checkbox"/>
TRANSPARENCY	<input type="checkbox"/>
USABILITY	<input type="checkbox"/>
COMPATABILITY	<input type="checkbox"/>

10 What can we do to make the system robust against abuse, whilst still benefiting from migrants working and studying in the UK?

Questions 9 & 10: We submit that the objectives of the system must first be changed, and that all the characteristics listed in Question 9 are important in carrying out policy.

**Tiers 1 and 2**

**11** Which of the following attributes do you think are most important for Tiers 1 and 2?

	Least Important	Less Important	Neutral Importance	More Important	Most Important
<b>Age</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>English Language Proficiency</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Job Offer</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Previous Salary</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Work Experience</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Skills/Qualifications</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

**Are there any others? Please give reasons for your choices.**

Q11: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

**12** Would the proposed outline design for Tiers 1 and 2 exclude any migrants who enter the UK under current Work Permit and Highly Skilled Migrant Programme arrangements? Should these people be allowed to work under the new system? If yes, please state why you think they should be allowed to work under the new system and how this relates to the objectives set out in Section 5.

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Q12: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

**13** Do you agree with the proposal for the Skills Advisory Body set out in section 6?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Q13 Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the

level of inward migration.

- 14** Should employers be able to access migrant labour for non-shortage occupations (i.e. those not identified by the Skills Advisory Body) and what would be the most effective mechanism for doing so?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Q14: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

**Tier 3**

15 Which bodies or organisations should be involved in identifying labour shortages involving low or basic levels of skills?

Q15: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

16 There will be a number of responsibilities associated with proposed Tier 3 schemes. Which of these should be placed on operators and employers of low skilled migrants?

**Operator**

**Employer**

- |                          |  |                          |
|--------------------------|--|--------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <b>Selecting Migrants Overseas</b>                             | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <b>Providing Induction to the UK</b>                           | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <b>Administering Compulsory Admittances</b>                    | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <b>Ensuring Migrants are not working Illegally</b>             | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <b>Ensuring Migrants return home at the end of their Leave</b> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

17 Should employers seeking to fill particular vacancies with participants on Tier 3 schemes be required to demonstrate that they have attempted to fill that vacancy with a resident worker?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Q17: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

18 Should there be an English language requirement for Tier 3 workers?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Q18: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

**Tier 4**

19 What are your views about what a points system for students might mean in practice?

Q19: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

20 Should leave to enter or remain in the UK for students be linked to a specific course at a specific institution?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Q20: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

21 Should educational institutions be required to help maintain integrity of the immigration control in order to be able to issue certificates of sponsorship?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Q21: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

**Tier 5**

22 What are the benefits to the UK of these kinds of temporary/exchange workers in Tier 5?

Q22: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

23 Is it right that the system should provide for them?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

Q23: Not relevant to environmental objectives unless the effect of decisions taken is to reduce the level of inward migration.

24 Should there be provision for tier 5 workers to switch into tiers 1 or 2?

Yes  No

25 Should additional conditions be attached?

Yes  No

### Sponsors

26 Do you think employers, educational institutions and other sponsors have a responsibility in maintaining the integrity of the immigration control?

Yes  No

27 What should employers, educational institutions and other sponsors be expected to do to carry out that responsibility?

Q27 We submit that it is not only important for employers to carry out their responsibility in maintaining the integrity of immigration control, alongside the government, but that employers should be encouraged to make greater efforts to bring unemployed British workers back into employment - particularly older and disadvantaged workers, including those from ethnic minorities.

28 What should be the criteria for being on a list of recognised sponsors?

**Bonds**

29 To which types of case would it be sensible for bonds to be applied? For example, should a bond be required of applicants from countries defined as “high risk” according to accepted criteria (number of breaches, returns etc.)? What about applicants from categories of entry regarded as “high risk”?

30 How should a bonds scheme be operated?

31 Is contracting out a better option than trying to combine it with existing migration work?

Yes  No

Please provide additional comments in the space provided

**Countering illegal working**

32 What improvements (e.g. different documentation) would help employers understand whether foreign nationals are entitled to work?

33 What additional services would help employers in ensuring that they are not employing illegal migrant workers?

### Information about your organisation

The following information will help with the analysis of responses to the consultation.

34 On average, how many applications do you make to IND per year?

- |                                |                                     |
|--------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Less than 1 per year           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| 1 – 10 applications per year   | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| 11 – 20 applications per year  | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| 21 – 50 applications per year  | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| 51 – 100 applications per year | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| More than 100                  | <input type="checkbox"/>            |

35 Please tick one of the following boxes which would best describe your organisation.

- |  |                                     |
|--|-------------------------------------|
| Micro Company (0 - 9 employees)                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Small Business (10 – 49 employees)                         | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Small-medium Enterprise (50 – 249 employees)               | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Large Company (employing over 250 employees)               | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Individuals completing this questionnaire please tick here | <input type="checkbox"/>            |

36 Which of the following categories does your organisation fall into?

- Voluntary Organisation / Charity
- Public Sector Employer
- Employer / Trade Association
- Union
- Private Company
- Immigration Advisor/Immigration Law Practitioner
- Applicant
- Sponsor
- Educational institution
- Other

If you have answered other, please specify in the space provided

37 Please tick the box that best describes the Industrial Sector your organisation falls into?

- Administration, Business & Management Services
- Agriculture Activities
- Computer Services
- Construction & Land Services
- Education & Cultural Activities
- Entertainment & Leisure Services
- Extraction Industries
- Financial Services
- Government
- Private Health & Medical Services
- NHS Trust
- Hospitality, Hotel and Catering & Other Related Services
- Law Related Services
- Manufacturing
- Real Estate & Property Services
- Retail & Related Services
- Security & Protective Services
- Sporting Activities
- Telecommunications
- Transport
- Utilities – Gas, Electricity, Water
- Telecommunications
- Telecommunications
- Other services

38 For statistical purposes, please indicate in which region of the UK your business is based.

- England
- Scotland
- Wales
- Northern Ireland

39 Please complete the following details:

1 Name of company/organisation/Individual

**Optimum Population Trust**

2 Address of company/organisation/Individual

**12 Meadowgate, Urmston, Manchester M41 9LB**

3 Telephone Number

**OPT: 07976-370 221**

4 Your Name

**Rosamund McDougall**

5 Your Position

**Member, Advisory Council**

## How To Respond

The consultation is being launched on 19 July 2005 and will close on 7 November 2005. Please ensure your response reaches us by **7 November 2005**.

Please return completed forms to:

**Managed Migration Customer Services Team**  
**PO Box 3468**  
**Sheffield**  
**S3 8WA**

**Fax: 0114 259 3776**

Further copies of the consultation paper can be obtained from the above address or from our distribution centre on Tel: 08705 210224. You should also contact the Customer Services Team should you require a copy of the consultation paper in any other format e.g. Braille, large font or audio.

Alternatively consultation forms are available from the Home Office website at:  
[www.homeoffice.gov.uk](http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk) or [www.directgov.uk](http://www.directgov.uk) and completed forms can be sent electronically to:

[Pointsbased.consultation@ind.homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:Pointsbased.consultation@ind.homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk)

If you have any queries regarding this consultation please contact:

**Managed Migration Customer Services Team**

**Tel: 0114 259 7482**

### Confidentiality and disclaimer

Please note that any information provided in response may be passed to colleagues within the Home office or elsewhere, and may be published in the summary of responses. We will assume that you are content for us to do this, and that, if you are replying by e mail, your content overrides any confidentiality disclaimer that is generated by your organisation's IT system, unless you specifically include a request to the contrary. If you wish your response or name to be kept confidential please ensure this is clearly marked on your response. Confidential responses will be included in any statistical summary of numbers of comments received and views expressed.

Submissions from respondents may also be subject to release under the Freedom of Information Act 2000. If you have instructed us accordingly, we will ensure that your views are not attributed should they be released in this way.

### What Happens Next

A full analysis of responses will be undertaken following the consultation and published. On the basis of the responses received and evidence gathered during the consultation period, a final decision on the proposals will be taken in early 2006.

A summary of responses will be made available at that time to be accessed via our website at:

[www.homeoffice.gov.uk](http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk)

or by request from:

**Managed Migration Customer Services Team**  
**PO Box 3468**  
**Sheffield**  
**S3 8WA**

**Tel: 0114 259 7482 (Mon – Fri 09:30 – 16:30)**  
**Fax: 0114 259 3776**

### **Consultation Coordinator**

A partial Regulatory Impact Assessment will be published on the Home Office website, [www.homeoffice.gov.uk](http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk) during the consultation period, as will a list of all the people and organisations consulted. If you have any complaints or comments about the consultation process, you should contact the Home Office consultation co-ordinator, Pio Smith by email at:

[Pio.Smith31@homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:Pio.Smith31@homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk)

**Or by post to:**

**Pio Smith**  
**Performance and Delivery Unit**  
**Better Government Team**  
**3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Seacole**  
**2, Marsham Street**  
**London**  
**SW1P 4DF**

**Your opinions are valuable to us. Thank you for taking the time to complete this questionnaire.**